

Ethical dilemma frame



Test one dilemma through three lenses.

NAME _____ CLASS _____ DATE _____

LEARNING GOAL

Analyse a moral dilemma from three viewpoints.

SUCCESS CRITERIA

- ☐ I can say what each viewpoint asks.
- ☐ I can give reasons, not only opinions.

1 The dilemma

A classic thought experiment. Invented wording, no real people.

Thought experiment

A runaway tram is heading towards five people who cannot move. You are beside a lever. If you pull it, the tram turns onto another track where one person stands. **Do you pull the lever?**

2 Gut reaction

Your first instinct, before any analysis.

Before analysing, tick one:

☐

Yes

☐

No

☐

Not sure

BECAUSE

3 Three perspectives

You are testing each viewpoint, not claiming it as your own.

Reasons count

01

Teleological

judges an action by its consequences (Greek telos: end, purpose).

What would a teleological thinker ask? Who is affected, how many, how likely?

REASONING

02

Deontological

judges actions by duty and rules (Greek deon: duty).

What would a deontological thinker ask? What rules apply, and does intention matter?

REASONING

03

Religious viewpoint

Name only a tradition you have studied.

What might someone from this tradition say? Which teachings or guidance might they consult, and how might they apply them?

TRADITION

REASONING



4

A variation

Invented for this sheet.

Variation

The same tram, but the only way to stop it is to push a stranger onto the track. **Do you push?**

5 Compare the two

Use your page 1 notes. Be specific.

Both dilemmas

a

LEVER

My view

Lever and push.

PUSH

+

ARGUMENT

Strongest argument for

Your best reason to act.

—

ARGUMENT

Strongest argument against

Your best reason not to.

?

YES OR NO,
AND WHY

Did my view change?

Say why, or why not.

6 Check each lens

Does each viewpoint give the same answer to both dilemmas?

Tick one per row

Teleological

☐

Same answer

☐

Different answer

☐

Unsure

Deontological

☐

Same answer

☐

Different answer

☐

Unsure

Religious (my tradition)

☐

Same answer

☐

Different answer

☐

Unsure

DIFFERENCE



7 Evaluate

8 lines

How far do the three viewpoints agree? Which reasoning persuades you most, and why?¹

STARTERS

A teleological thinker would say...

However, a duty-based view...

The strongest reason is...

I changed my mind because...

One weakness is...

?

I WOULD
CHANGE IF

What would change my mind?

A fact, a rule or a teaching.

VS

CHALLENGE

A partner challenges me

Listen, then reply.

MY REPLY

8

My final position

Now I would pull the lever:

☐

Yes

☐

No

☐

Not sure

Back to the lever.

ONE QUESTION
I STILL HAVE

¹ Both dilemmas are invented thought experiments. Never share a personal experience on this sheet.